Journal of Pharmacognosy and Phytochemistry

Available online at www.phytojournal.com

E-ISSN: 2278-4136
P-ISSN: 2349-8234
JPP 2017; 6(1): 102-108
Received: 16-11-2016
Accepted: 17-12-2016

Salman Ahmed
Lecturer, Department of Pharmacognosy, Faculty of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Muhammad Mohtasheemul Hasan
Associate Professor, Department of Pharmacognosy, Faculty of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Zafar Alam Mahmood
Country manager, Colorcon Limited – UK, Flagship House, Victory Way, Crossways, Dartford, Kent, DA26 QD-England

Correspondence
Salman Ahmed
Lecturer, Department of Pharmacognosy, Faculty of Pharmacy and Pharmaceutical Sciences, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Urolithiasis in gel: Successful journey of an *in vitro* model from vision to reality

Salman Ahmed, Muhammad Mohtasheemul Hasan and Zafar Alam Mahmood

Abstract
This review shares historical glimpses behind the art and science of urinary crystal growth in gel. This successful journey of long and painstaking research consists of both theoretical and experimental knowledge. The survey consists of historical aspects of crystal growth, development of urinary crystal growth in gel as an *in vitro* urolithiasis model and the application of this model to evaluate prophylactic management against kidney stones.

Keywords: Urolithiasis, gel, *in vitro* models, Liesegang rings

1. Introduction
Urolithiasis is one of the oldest, most common and recurrent disease. Urinary calculi are composed of insoluble crystalline compounds of ammonium, calcium, magnesium and phosphorous. Calcium oxalate monohydrate (whewellite), calcium oxalate dihydrate (weddellite), calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate (brushite), ammonium acid urate, mono sodium urate monohydrate, uric acid anhydrous, uric acid mono and dihydrate and ammonium magnesium phosphate hexahydrate (struvite) are the examples of these compounds [1]. Crystallization of salt from sea water by burning of earthenware is considered as one of the oldest methods of crystallization. The story of crystal growth in gel medium started when the lead iodide crystals were grown in fruit jelly and jam. The formation of the Liesegang ring in gel turns the history of crystal growth from aqueous to non aqueous media. The series of theoretical and experimental contributions developed "crystal growth in gel" as an *in vitro* technique. The growth of oxalate, phosphate and urate crystals made possible to grow urinary crystals in gel. The promotory or inhibitory effect of herbal extracts on growing urinary crystals provides a pathway for *in vitro* evaluation of risk factors or prophylactic management of kidney stones. The contributions and findings of this successful journey are highlighted in Table-1.

Crystal growth in the gel is a simple, easy and inexpensive *in vitro* technique which provides crystals of different morphologies and sizes along with practical observation of crystal growth stages [2]. Gel medium is very useful for studying crystal deposition diseases such as the formation of atherosclerotic plaque, gall stones, gouty crystals and urinary stones [3]. The gel medium is chemically inert, prevents the turbulence and provides a framework of separated nucleation sites to grow single crystal. The viscous nature, temperature and pH of the gel provide a resemblance with human physiological conditions. However, the size, quality and quantity of growing crystal during the experiment can't be predicted [4, 5]. The basic principle of this technique is generally explained as, "When the specific concentration of two suitable compounds are allowed to diffuse into a gel. These compounds react chemically with reactants present in gel, form a precipitate of periodic bands or rings (Liesegang patterns) and leading to the growth of insoluble crystals of required compound" [2, 4]. Pathologic crystallization is a complex process which causes atherosclerotic plaque, gall stones, gout and urinary stones. Therefore the study to find out crystallization promoting or inhibiting factors is important [6, 7]. The direct observation of crystallization is not possible by *in vivo* models and the mechanism remains unexplained. *In vitro* models not only provide the direct observation of crystal growth, but also devising the meaning of unwanted crystal promotion, modulation or inhibition. Growth of pathologic crystals in gel along with plant extracts and juices gives important information about crystallization promotion, modulation or inhibition by comparing the changes. These changes include shape, size, transparency, approximate number and total mass of crystals [6]. In case of inhibition, it assures prophylactic management by evaluation of nucleation, growth and aggregation of growing crystals.

Therefore, this *in vitro* technique provides a multidisciplinary approach in characterizing the grown crystals and help in formulating a strategy for the prevention or dissolution of urinary crystals. In case of promotion, i.e. increase in size and number of crystals give an idea about risk factors [8]. Crystallization by gel diffusion technique has been divided into following five methods as chemical reaction, chemical reduction, complex dilution, solubility reduction and electrolytic method. Chemical reaction methods are classified as single and double diffusion [9-15]. Hence urinary crystals have been grown by a chemical reaction method. So, contribution regarding this method is mentioned in the survey. Gel technique is not limited to urinary crystals. It has applied to grow different other pathologic crystals as well as crystals of sex hormones such as cholesterol, progesterone and testosterone [16-19]. The same technique is now successfully applied to different areas of biotechnology and nanotechnology.

Table 1: Historical background of urolithiasis in gel.

Year	Contributors	Findings / Contributions	References
Before Christian Era	Not documented	Crystallization of salt from sea water by burning of earthenware (evaporation).	[20]
$12^{th} - 13^{th}$ century	Geber (Jabir Ibn Hayyan, the great Muslim Chemist)	Described the purification of materials by recrystallization, sublimation and distillation.	
1540	Birringuccio	Recorded the leaching of saltpeter and its purification by recrystallization.	
1556	Agricola	Shared the crystallization of alum and vitriol.	
1611	Kepler	Shared the principle of crystallographic forms.	
1602	Caesalpinus	Observed crystals of alum, saltpeter, sugar and vitriol in solutions.	
1665	Hooke	Claimed microscopic arrangement of spherical particles to form crystal.	
1669	Nicolaus Steno	Crystal growth via addition of material from outside not by vegetative mode.	
1773	Bergman	Crystals break into smallest unit (crystal cleavage) and the repetition of smallest unit formation responsible for crystal growth.	
1795	Lowitz	Super saturation of solution is required for crystal formation.	
1813	Schweigger	Minimum size of crystal nuclei is required to initiate crystallization.	
1815	Weiss	Derived the crystal systems.	
1824	Seeber	Lattice type arrangement is responsible to form crystal.	
1849	Bravais	Derived 14 types of crystal lattice.	
1878	Gibb	Determined the total minimum free surface energy needed to generate a nucleus for crystallization.	
1882	Gernez	Quantitatively measured rate of crystal growth.	
1885	Curie	Layer-by-layer adsorption of atoms or molecule is responsible for crystal growth.	[21]
1886	Ostwald	Explained nucleation phenomena which support Liesegang ring formation.	[22]
1891	Marriage	Observed lead iodide crystals in fruit jelly and jam.	[23]
1896	Liesegang	Observed Liesegang ring formation in gel.	[24]
1897	Ostwald	Supersaturation causes Liesegang ring formation.	[20]
1898	Tammann	Quantitatively measured nucleation process to form crystal.	
1900	Ostwald	Derived the thermodynamic formula for the enhanced solubility of small particles. Explained dependence of solubility on particle size.	
1911	Hatschek	First to report that crystals grow better in silica gel than in gelatin or agar. Liesegang rings themselves consist of substantial crystals. He made a systematic study of particle size distribution in these rings.	[25]
1913	Dreaper	Diffusion of reactants through capillary pores of gel aiding efficient crystal formation.	[26]
	Bragg	X-ray crystal structure determination.	[20]
1914	Johnston	Diffusion technique to grow compounds.	
1917	Holmes	Used less acidic silica gel to produce crystalline salts not possible in acidic gel. Grown hexagonal plates of lead iodide, needles of mercuric iodide, sheets of silver acetate and rhombohedral crystals of monosodium phosphate in silica gel.	[27]
1923	Davies	The influence of light in crystal growth.	[28]
1926	Lloyd	Preliminary survey on gel structures.	[2]
	Holmes	Used the dialyzing process for gels to eliminate excess interfering reagents for diffusing components in U-tubes.	
	Endres	Observed growth of ice crystals in ice cream and tartrate crystals in cheese.	
	Fells and Firth	Capillary pores of silica gel were found to be the center of crystal growth.	[29]
1931	Morse and Donnay	Investigated three-dimensional structure of spherulites.	[30]
1947	Plank	Proposed ionic mechanism for silica and silica-alumina gel formation.	[31]
1949	Frank	Crystal growth occurs in spiral fashion by a continuous process.	[32]
1965	Hektisch *et al.*	Described a technique to grow single crystal in silica gel. Further shared that the crystal growth in gel ceases after complete utilization of reactants.	[33]
1966	Kurz	Grown mercuric iodide crystals by chemical reaction method in silica gel.	[34]
		Grown mercuric chloride crystals by chemical reaction method in silica gel.	[35]
1967	Dennis and Henisch	Nucleation of crystal in gel depends on reagent concentration and impurities.	[36]
1968	Halberstadt and	Nucleation of crystal in gel influenced by pH and reagent additives.	[2]

	Henisch		
	Kratochvil *et al.*	Grown hexagonal and triangular shaped gold crystals by chemical reaction method in silica gel.	[10]
1969	Kurz	Grown needles and rhombohedral shaped potassium acid tartrate crystals by chemical reaction method in silica gel.	[11]
1971	Březina and Havrankova	Grown potassium dihydrogen phosphate single crystals in agar gel.	[37]
1973	Banks *et al.*	Grown CHPD, AMPH, strontium hydrogen phosphate and barium hydrogen phosphate crystals in gelatin.	[38]
1975	Bisaillon and Tawashi	Grown single, bipyramidal and rosette shaped COM and COD crystals in silica gel and gelatin.	[39]
1976	Cody	Grown gypsum crystals in bentonite gel.	[40]
	Březina	Growth of lead (II) hydrogen phosphate in polyacrylamide gel.	[41]
1978	Martin and Haendler	Prepared gel inside the horizontal tube opens at both ends.	[42]
1980	Patel and Rao	Modified gel method to facilitate the growth of single larger crystals.	[43]
1981	Arora	Used modified equipment for better crystallization.	[14]
1982	Arend and Connelly	Used tetramethoxysilane gel for crystal growth.	[44]
	Lefaucheux *et al.*	Compared gel grown and solution grown crystals.	[45]
1985	Barber and Simpson	Used ion exchange resins for better crystallization.	[46]
1986	Henisch and Garcia-Ruiz	Explained Liesegang ring formation by Fick's diffusion equation and calculated Liesegang ring masses and spacing on the basis of a simple algorithm.	[47]
1988	Henisch	Designed a simple computer program, to record growth-rate oscillations during Liesegang rings formation.	[48]
	Sperka	Discussed principal features of crystal growth in gels.	[5]
1990	Cipanov *et al.*	Presented experimental and theoretical investigations of the nucleation processes of calcium tartrate crystal formation in gel.	[49]
1991	Chernavskii *et al.*	Explained helix type Liesegang pattern.	[50]
	Plovnick	Grown CHPD crystals from EDTA-chelated calcium in agar gel and these crystals were characterized by IR, SEM and XRD.	[51]
1993	Kalkura *et al.*	Grown platy crystals of uric acid dihydrate crystals in tetramethoxysilane and silica gel.	[52]
	Irusan *et al.*	*Phyllanthus niruri* and *Ocimum sanctum* plant extracts inhibited dendritic and needle shaped CHPD crystals by single diffusion gel method in silica gel.	[53]
1994	Chopard *et al.*	Observed rings, bands and spiral types Liesegang patterns.	[54]
1995	Girija *et al.*	Grown hexagonal cystine crystals by single diffusion methods and these crystals were analyzed by IR and XRD.	[55]
	Kalkura	Grown spherulitic and bow shaped MSUM crystals in tetramethoxysilane and silica gel and characterized these crystals by IR, TGA and XRD.	[56]
1996	Srinivasan and Natarajan	Grown COM, CHPD and AMPH crystals by single and double diffusion method.	[57]
	Garcia-Ruiz	The kinetics of Liesegang pattern formation in gel medium remains unaffected by gravity.	[58]
1997	Natarajan *et al.*	Observed the promotory and inhibitory effect of extracts or juices of *Ananas comosus*, *Borassus flabellifer*, *Citrus limon*, *Cocos nucifera*, *Lycopersicon esculentum*, *Tamarindus indica*, *Tribulus terrestris*, *Vitis vinifera* (fruits); *Dolichos biflorus*, *Hordeum vulgare* (grains or seeds) ; *Mentha spicata* (leaves) ; *Mimosa pudica*, *Hibiscus rosa-sinensis* (plant) ; *Raphanus sativus* (roots); *Musa sapientum* (stem) on COM, CHPD, and AMPH crystals grown by single and double diffusion methods. Same crystals were characterized by XRD and density measurement.	[6]
1998	Sivakumar *et al.*	Grown dendritic, platy and triangular shaped calcium hydrogen phosphate anhydrous (monetite) and CHPD crystals in silica gel and characterized these crystals were by FT-IR, TGA and XRD.	[59]
2002	Ramachandran and Natarajan	Grown needle and spherulite shaped tyrosine crystals by single and double diffusion methods. The grown crystals were characterized by density measurement, FT-IR, TGA and XRD.	[60]
		Grown rectangular and platy hippuric acid crystals in silica gel by double diffusion method. Grown crystals were characterized by density measurement, FT-IR, TGA and XRD.	[61]
2003	Joshi and Joshi	Grown platelet and needle shaped CHPD crystals by single diffusion gel method in silica gel. The crystals were analyzed by FTIR and TGA.	[62]
2004	Ramachandran and Natarajan	Grown hexagonal shaped L-cystine crystals in silica gel by double diffusion method. These grown crystals were characterized by density measurement, FT-IR, TGA and XRD.	[63]
	Kalkura *et al.*	Platy and spherulite shaped HA crystals were grown in silica gel by single diffusion method.	[64]
2005	Joseph *et al.*	*Tamarindus indica* fruit decoction and tartaric acid both inhibited the growth of CHPD crystals grown by single diffusion method.	[65]
	Ramachandran and Natarajan	Grown trapezoidal and platy hippuric acid crystals in silica gel by single diffusion method and characterized these crystals by XRD and density values.	[66]
	Joshi *et al.*	*Tribulus terrestris* fruits and *Bergenia ligulata* leaves extracts inhibited the growth of COM crystals grown in silica gel by double diffusion method.	[67]

	Parekh and Joshi	Citric acid inhibited elongated, platelet and star shaped CHPD crystals grown by single diffusion gel method in silica gel.	[68]
2007	Sundaramoorthi and Kalainathan	Grown barium hydrogen phosphate crystals by single and double diffusion methods in silica gel. The grown crystals were analyzed by XRD, TGA/DTA and SEM.	[69]
	Kanchana *et al.*	The nucleation rate of gel grown brushite crystal reduced more in the laser than the sunlight exposed medium. The results were analyzed by XRD, TGA/DTA, and SEM.	[70]
2008	Chauhan *et al.*	Grown dendritic, prismatic, rectangular and star shaped AMPH crystals by single diffusion method by using silica gel. These crystals were characterized by XRD, FT-IR, TGA and dielectric studies.	[71]
	Chauhan and Joshi	*Citrus medica* juice inhibited AMPH crystals grown by single diffusion method.	[72]
	Parekh *et al.*	*Boswellia serrata* (gum resin), *Tribulus terrestris* (fruits), *Rotula aquatica*, *Boerhaavia diffusa* (roots) and *Commiphora wightii* (plant) extracts inhibited the growth of HA crystals grown by single diffusion method. The characterization of grown crystals was confirmed by XRD, FT-IR and dielectric study.	[73]
2009		Roots extract of *Aerva lanata, Boerhaavia diffusa* and *Rotula aquatica* ; gum resin of *Boswellia serrata* inhibited MSUM crystals grown by single diffusion method. These grown crystals were characterized by FT-IR, XRD and TGA.	[74]
	Chauhan *et al.*	*Commiphora wightii* fruit juice inhibited dendritic, prismatic, rectangular, star and needle shaped AMPH crystals grown by single diffusion method.	[75]
	Madhurambal *et al.*	Grown platelet and broad needle shaped CHPD crystals by the single diffusion method in silica gel. The crystals were analyzed by FTIR. Kinetic and thermodynamic parameters were also estimated.	[76]
2010	Rajendran and Dale Keefe	Grown CHPD crystals by single diffusion method and analyzed these crystals by DSC, XRD, FT-Raman, and FT-IR.	[77]
	Valarmathi *et al.*	Grown COM crystals by single diffusion method and analyzed these crystals by FT-IR.	[78]
2011	Choubey	*Ceiba pentandra* bark extract inhibited the growth of MSUM crystals grown by single diffusion method and were characterized by FT-IR, TGA and XRD.	[79]
2012	Kesavan *et al.*	*Costus igneus* stem and rhizome extract inhibited COM crystals grown by single diffusion method. These harvested crystals were characterized by FT-IR, SEM and XRD.	[80]
	Salim	Grown COM crystals by double diffusion method and determined their dielectric properties.	[81]
	Diana and George	*Achyranthes aspera* root extract inhibited the gel grown CHPD crystals by single diffusion method.	[82]
2013		*Ensete superbum* seed extract inhibited the gel grown CHPD crystals by single diffusion method.	[83]
	Chauhan and Joshi	*Citrus medica* (fruit juice) and *Commiphora wightii*, *Boerhaavia diffusa* and *Rotula aquatica* (plant infusions) inhibited the growth of gel grown AMPH crystals.	[84]
2014	Vasuki and Selvaraju	*Citrus limon* and *Tribulus terrestris* fruit extracts inhibited the uric acid crystals grown by single diffusion method. These crystals were characterized by FT-IR, FT-Raman, SEM and XRD.	[85]
	Suryawanshi and Chaudhari	Grown dendritic and prismatic COM crystals by single and double diffusion method in agar-agar gel and characterized these crystals by FT-IR, TGA and XRD.	[86]
		Grown dendritic, needle, platy, prismatic, rectangular and star shaped crystals by single diffusion and dendritic shaped CHPD crystals by double diffusion method in agar-agar gel. These crystals were analyzed by FT-IR, SEM, TGA and XRD.	[87]
		Grown platy, prismatic, star shaped crystals by single diffusion and dumbbell, star and platy shaped struvite-k crystals by double diffusion method in agar-agar gel. These crystals were analyzed by EDS, FT-IR, SEM, TGA and XRD.	[88]
2015		Grown dendritic, needle, platy, prismatic, rectangular and star shaped CHPD crystals by the single diffusion method in agar-agar gel. The crystals were analyzed by stereoscope and EDS.	[89]
	Popalghat and Bhagat	Grown elongated rod shaped COM crystals by single diffusion method in silica gel and characterized these crystals by FT-IR and XRD.	[90]
	Ahmed *et al.*	Grown spherical ring banded dumbbell and composite spherulites of MSUM crystals on a glass slide in silica gel and observed under compound microscope.	[91]
	Bindhu *et al.*	*Phyllanthus emblica* fruit extract inhibited the growth of AMPH crystals grown in silica gel by single diffusion method. Grown crystals were characterized by FT-IR, SEM, TGA and XRD.	[92]
2016	Joshi	*Citrus limon* fruit juice and *Hordeum vulgare* seed extract, citric acid and tartaric acid affected the growth of gel grown CHPD crystals. The growth inhibition and reduction were measured by a reduction in the number of Liesegang rings and size of grown crystals.	[93]
	Ahmed *et al.*	Grown arborescent, donut, dumbbell, needles, platy, prismatic, rosette, crystal with round edges, loose agglomerate and compact aggregates of COM crystals on a glass slide in silica gel and observed under compound microscope.	[94]
		Grown needle, platy (with spatial branches and radiating assemblage), star, tetragonal bipyramidal shaped crystals of CHPD on a glass slide in silica gel and observed under compound microscope.	[95]
	Selvaraju and Sulochana	*Tribulus terrestris* fruits extract inhibited the growth of COM crystals grown in silica gel by single diffusion method.	[96]

	Muryanto *et al.*	*Orthosiphon aristatus* leaves extract inhibited the growth of AMPH in gel. The grown crystals were characterized by FT-IR, SEM and XRD.	[97]

Keys: AMPH: ammonium magnesium phosphate hexahydrate or struvite, CHPD: calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate or brushite, COD: calcium oxalate dihydrate or weddellite, COM: calcium oxalate monohydrate or whewellite, DSC: differential scanning calorimetry, EDS: Energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy, FT-IR: Fourier Transform Infrared spectroscopy, HA: hydroxyapatite, IR: infra red spectroscopy, MSUM: Monosodium urate monohydrate, Saltpeter: potassium nitrate, Silica gel: sodium meta silicate gel, TGA/DTA: Thermogravimetric analysis / Differential thermal analysis, Vitriol: sulphuric acid, XRD: X-ray powder diffraction.

References

1. Menon M, Parulkar B, Drach G. Urinary Lithiasis: Etiology, diagnosis and medical management. In Campbell's Urology, Walsh, P.C. (Ed.). 7th Edn., WB Saunders Co.: Philadelphia. 1998; 3:2661-2733.
2. Henisch HK. Crystal growth in gels. Helvetica Physica Acta. 1968; 41(1):888-897.
3. Patel A, Rao AV. Crystal growth in gel media. Bulletin of Materials Science. 1982; 4(5):527-548.
4. Robert M, Lefaucheux F. Crystal growth in gels: principle and applications. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1988; 90(1):358-367.
5. Sperka G. Crystal growth in gels—a survey. Progress in Colloid and Polymer Science. 1988; 77:207-210.
6. Natarajan S, Rmachandran E, Suja DB. Growth of some urinary crystals and studies on inhibitors and promoters. II. X-ray studies and inhibitory or promotery role of some substances. Crystal Research and Technology. 1997; 32(4):553-559.
7. Kalkura N, Natarajan S. Crystallization from gels, in Springer Handbook of Crystal Growth. Govindhan D, Kullaiah B, Vishwanath P, Michael, D. Editors. Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg: New York. 2010.
8. Ahmed S, Hasan MM, Alam Z. *In vitro* urolithiasis models: An evaluation of prophylactic management against kidney stones. Journal of Pharmacognosy and Phytochemistry. 2016; 5(3):28-35.
9. Halberstadt ES. Growth of single crystals of silver iodide in silica gel. Nature. 1967; 216(5115):574.
10. Kratochvil P, Sprusil B, Heyrovsky M. Growth of gold single crystals in gels. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1968; 3-4:360-362.
11. Kurz PF. Some chemical reactions in silica gels: III. Formatin of potassium acid tartarate crystals. The Ohio Journal of Science. 1969; 69(5):296-304.
12. Glocker DA, Soest JF. Growth of single crystals of monobasic ammonium phosphate in gel. The Journal of Chemical Physics. 1969; 51(7):3143.
13. George MT, Vaidyan VK. An electrolytic method to grow copper dendrites and single crystals in gels. Kristall und Technik. 1980; 15(6):653-659.
14. Arora S. Advances in gel growth: a review. Progress in Crystal Growth and Characterization. 1981; 4:345-378.
15. Arora S, Abraham T. Controlled nucleation of cadmium oxalate in silica hydrogel and characterization of grown crystals. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1981; 52(2):851-857.
16. Kalkura SN, Devanarayanan S. Growth of progresterone crystals in silica gel and their characterization. Journal of Materials Science Letters. 1988; 7(8):827-829.
17. Kalkura SN, Devanarayanan S. Crystal growth of steroids in silica gel: Testosterone. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1989; 94(3):810-813.
18. Kalkura SN, Devanarayanan S. Crystallization of steroids in gels. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1991; 110(1):265-269.
19. Elizabeth A, Joseph C, Ittyachen M. Growth and micro-topographical studies of gel grown cholesterol crystals. Bulletin of Materials Science. 2001; 24(4): 431-434.
20. Bohm J. The history of crystal growth. Acta Physica Hungarica. 1985; 57(3-4):161-178.
21. Bhavsar D. Growth of perfect and imperfect crystals in gel: A general view. Advances in Applied Science Research. 2012; 3(3):1250-1254.
22. Ostwald W. Lehrbuch der allgemeinen Chemie. 1886, 2. W. Engelmann.
23. Suib SL. Crystal growth in gels. Journal of Chemical Education. 1985; 62(1):81-82.
24. Liesegang R. Ueber einige eigenschaften von gallerten. Naturwissenschaftliche Wochenschrift. 1896; 10(30):353-362.
25. Hatschek E. Die viskosität der dispersoide. Colloid & Polymer Science (Kolloid-Zeitschrift und Zeitschrift für Polymere). 1911; 8(1):34-39.
26. Dreaper W. Reactions in aqueous and colloidal systems. Journal of the Society of Chemical Industry. 1913; 32(13):678-684.
27. Holmes H. Formation of crystals in gels. Journal of Franklin Institute. 1917; 184(6):743-773.
28. Davies ECH. Liesegang rings. III. The effect of light and hydrogen-ion concentration on the formation of colloidal gold in silicic acid gel. Rhythmic bands of purple of cassius. Journal of the American Chemical Society. 1923; 45(10):2261-2268.
29. Fells H, Firth B. Change of crystal structure of some salts when crystallised from silicic acid gel-The structure of silicic acid gel. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series A, Containing Papers of a Mathematical and Physical Character. 1926; 112(761):468-474.
30. Morse H, Donnay J. Calcite artificielle obtenue par diffusion dans un gel. Bulletin de la Société Française de Minéralogie. 1931; 54:19- 23.
31. Plank C. Differences between silica and silica-alumina gels II. A proposed mechanism for the gelation and syneresis of these gels. Journal of Colloid Science. 1947; 2(4):413-427.
32. Frank FC. The influence of dislocations on crystal growth. Discussions of the Faraday Society. 1949; 5:48-54.
33. Hektisch H, Dennis J, Hanoka J. Crystal growth in gels. Journal of Physics and Chemistry of Solids. 1965; 26(3):493-496.
34. Kurz PF. Some chemical reactions in silica gels. I, Formation of mercuric iodide crystals. Ohio Journal of Science. 1966; 66(2):198-209.
35. Kurz PF. Some chemical reactions in silica gels II. Formation of crystals of a basic mercuric chloride, HgCl2-2HgO1. Ohio Journal of Science. 1966; 66(3):284-311.
36. Dennis J, Henisch HK. *Nucleation and growth of crystals in gels.* Journal of The Electrochemical Society. 1967; 114(3):263-266.
37. Březina B, Havrankova M. Growth of KH_2PO_4 single crystals in gel. Materials Research Bulletin. 1971; 6(7):537-543.

38. Banks E, Chianelli R, Pintchovsky F. The growth of some alkaline earth orthophosphates in gelatin gels. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1973; 18(2):185-190.
39. Bisaillon S, Tawashi R. Growth of calcium oxalate in gel systems. Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences. 1975; 64(3):458-460.
40. Cody RD. Growth and early diagenetic changes in artificial gypsum crystals grown within bentonite muds and gels. Geological Society of America Bulletin. 1976; 87(8):1163-1168.
41. Březina B, Havránková M, Dušek K. The growth of $PbHPO_4$ and $Pb_4(NO_3)_2$ $(PO_4)_2 \cdot 2H_2O$ in gels. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1976; 34(2):248-252.
42. Martin SA, Haendler H. A modified diffusion apparatus for the growth of single crystals. Journal of Applied Crystallography. 1978; 11(1):62.
43. Patel A, Rao AV. An improved design to grow larger and more perfect single crystals in gels. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1980; 49(3):589-590.
44. Arend H, Connelly J. Tetramethoxysilane as gel forming agent in crystal growth. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1982; 56(3):642-644.
45. Lefaucheux F, Robert M, Manghi E. A comparison between gel grown and solution grown crystals—case of ADP and KDP. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1982; 56(1):141-150.
46. Barber PG, Simpson NR. A clarified gel for crystal growth. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1985; 73(2):400-402.
47. Henisch H, Garcia-Ruiz J. Crystal growth in gels and Liesegang ring formation: I. Diffusion relationships. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1986; 75(2):195-202.
48. Henisch HK. Growth waves in periodic precipitation. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1988; 87(4):571-572.
49. Cipanov A, Goshka L, Ruzov V. Crystal growth in gel: Investigation of nucleation processes. Crystal Research and Technology. 1990; 25(7):737-746.
50. Chernavskii D, Polezhaev A, Müller S. A model of pattern formation by precipitation. Physica D: Nonlinear Phenomena. 1991; 54(1):160-170.
51. Plovnick RH. Crystallization of brushite from EDTA-chelated calcium in agar gels. Journal of Crystal Growth, 1991; 114(1):22-26.
52. Kalkura SN, Vaidyan VK, Kanakavel M, Ramasamy P. Crystallization of uric acid. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1993; 132(3):617-620.
53. Irusan T, Kalkura SN, Arivuoli D, Ramasamy P. Dendritic structures of brushite in silica gel. Journal of Crystal Growth. 1993; 130(1-2):217-220.
54. Chopard B, Luthi P, Droz M. Microscopic approach to the formation of Liesegang patterns. Journal of Statistical Physics. 1994; 76(1-2):661-677.
55. Girija E, Kalkura SN, Ramasamy P. Crystallization of cystine. Journal of Materials Science: Materials in Medicine. 1995; 6(11):617-619.
56. Kalkura SN, Girija EK, Kanakavel M, Ramasamy P. *In-vitro* crystallization of spherulites of monosodium urate monohydrate. Journal of Materials Science: Materials in Medicine. 1995; 6(10):577-580.
57. Srinivasan N, Natarajan S. Growth of some urinary crystals and studies on inhibitors and promoters. I. Standardisation of parameters for crystal growth and characterization of crystals. Indian Journal of Physics. 1996; 70:563-568.
58. Garcia-Ruiz JM, Rondon D, Garcia-Romero A, Otalora F. Role of gravity in the formation of Liesegang patterns. The Journal of Physical Chemistry. 1996; 100(21):8854-8860.
59. Sivakumar GR, Girija EK, Narayana Kalkura S, Subramanian C. Crystallization and characterization of calcium phosphates: brushite and monetite. Crystal Research and Technology. 1998; 33(2):197-205.
60. Ramachandran E, Natarajan S. Crystal Growth of some urinary stone constituents: I. *In-vitro* crystallization of L-Tyrosine and its characterization. Crystal Research and Technology. 2002; 37(11):1160-1164.
61. Ramachandran E, Natarajan S. Crystal growth of some urinary stone constituents: II. *In-vitro* crystallization of hippuric acid. Crystal Research and Technology. 2002; 37(12):1274-1279.
62. Joshi VS, Joshi MJ. FTIR spectroscopic, thermal and growth morphological studies of calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals. Crystal Research and Technology. 2003; 38(9):817-821.
63. Ramachandran E, Natarajan S. Crystal growth of some urinary stone constituents: III. *In-vitro* crystallization of L-cystine and its characterization. Crystal Research and Technology. 2004; 39(4):308-312.
64. Kalkura SN, Anee TK, Ashok M, Betzel C. Investigations on the synthesis and crystallization of hydroxyapatite at low temperature. Bio-medical Materials and Engineering. 2004; 14(4):581-592.
65. Joseph K, Parekh BB, Joshi, M. Inhibition of growth of urinary type calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals by tartaric acid and tamarind. Current Science. 2005; 88(8):1232-1238.
66. Ramachandran E, Natarajan S. Growth habits of hippuric acid in gel. Crystal Research and Technology. 2005; 40(8):765-767.
67. Joshi VS, Parekh BB, Joshi MJ, Vaidya, AB. Herbal extracts of *Tribulus terrestris* and *Bergenia ligulata* inhibit growth of calcium oxalate monohydrate crystals *in vitro*. Journal of Crystal Growth. 2005; 275(1):p.e1403-e1408.
68. Parekh BB, Joshi M. Crystal growth and dissolution of brushite crystals by different concentration of citric acid solutions. Indian Journal of Pure and Applied Physics. 2005; 43(9):675-678.
69. Sundaramoorthi P, Kalainathan S. Crystal growth of some renal stones constituents: I. *In vitro* crystallization of trace element and Its characterization studies. Journal of Minerals and Materials Characterization and Engineering. 2007. 6(01):17-24.
70. Kanchana G, Sundaramoorthi P, Santhi R, Kalainathan S, Jeyanthi GP. Nucleation reduction strategy of (Brushite) CHP crystals in SMS media and its characterization studies. Journal of Minerals and Materials Characterization and Engineering. 2008; 7(1):49-57.
71. Chauhan CK, Joseph KC, Parekh BB, Joshi MJ. Growth and characterization of struvite crystals. Indian Journal of Pure & Applied Physics. 2008; 46(7):507-512.
72. Chauhan C, Joshi M. Growth inhibition of struvite crystals in the presence of juice of *Citrus medica* Linn. Urological Research. 2008; 36(5):265-273.
73. Parekh B, Joshi M, Vaidya A. Characterization and inhibitive study of gel-grown hydroxyapatite crystals at physiological temperature. Journal of Crystal Growth. 2008; 310(7):1749-1753.
74. Parekh BB, Vasant SR, Tank KP, Raut A, Vaidya A,

Joshi MJ. *In vitro* growth and inhibition studies of monosodium urate monohydrate crystals by different herbal extracts. American Journal of Infectious Diseases. 2009; 5:232-237.
75. Chauhan C, Joshi M, Vaidya A. Growth inhibition of struvite crystals in the presence of herbal extract *Commiphora wightii.* Journal of Materials Science: Materials in Medicine. 2009; 20(1):85-92.
76. Madhurambal G, Subha R, Mojumdar S. Crystallization and thermal characterization of calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals. Journal of Thermal Analysis and Calorimetry. 2009; 96(1):73-76.
77. Rajendran K, Dale Keefe C. Growth and characterization of calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals from single diffusion gel technique. Crystal Research and Technology. 2010; 45(9):939-945.
78. Valarmathi D, Abraham L, Gunasekaran, S. Growth of calcium oxalate monohydrate crystal by gel method and its spectroscopic analysis. Indian Journal of Pure Applied Physics. 2010; 48:36-38.
79. Choubey A. *In vitro* growth and inhibition studies of Ceiba pentandra on monosodium urate monohydrate crystals. Pharmacology online. 2011; 2:650-656.
80. Kesavan M, Kaliaperumal R, Tamilmani E, Shanmugam K. *In vitro* evaluation of calcium oxalate monohydrate crystals influenced by *Costus igneus* aqueous extract. Scandinavian Journal of Urology and Nephrology. 2012; 46(4):290-297.
81. Salim MA. The characteristics, dielectric properties and surface morphology of calcium oxalate monohydrate single crystals grown in silica gel. Journal of Chemical, Biological and Physical Sciences. 2012; 2(2):962-967.
82. Diana K, George K. George, *In-vitro* studies on antilithiatic property of *Achyranthes aspera* L. var. *aspera.* Hook. f. Journal of Pharmacy Research. 2012; 5(8):4366-4370.
83. Diana K, George K. Urinary stone formation: Efficacy of seed extract of *Ensete superbum* (Roxb.) Cheesman on growth inhibition of calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals. Journal of Crystal Growth. 2013; 363:164-170.
84. Chauhan CK, Joshi MJ. *In vitro* crystallization, characterization and growth-inhibition study of urinary type struvite crystals. Journal of Crystal Growth. 2013; 362:330-337.
85. Vasuki G, Selvaraju R. Growth and characterization of uric acid crystals. International Journal of Science and Research. 2014; 3(8):696-699.
86. Suryawanshi V, Chaudhari R. Growth and study of micro-crystalline calcium oxalate monohydrate crystals by agar gel system. Archives of Physics Research. 2014; 5(2):38-44.
87. Suryawanshi VB, Chaudhari RT. Growth and characterization of agar gel grown brushite crystals. Indian Journal of Materials Science. 2014, 6.
88. Suryawanshi VB, Chaudhari RT. Synthesis and characterization of struvite-k crystals by agar gel. Journal of Crystallization Process and Technology. 2014; 4(4):212-224.
89. Suryawanshi V, Chaudhari R. Effect of gel parameters on nucleation and growth of brushite crystals in agar-agar gel. Weekly Science Research Journal. 2015; 3(25):1-5.
90. Popalghat S, Bhagat A. The study of crystal growth of whewelite in gel media. International Journal of Recent Scientific Research. 2015; 6(2):2587-2589.
91. Ahmed S, Hasan M, Mahmood ZA. *In vitro* microscopic study of monosodium urate monohydrate crystals growth patterns. Journal of Pharmaceutical and Scientific Innovation. 2015; 4(6):295-297. http://doi.10.7897/2277-4572.04665
92. Bindhu B, Swetha A, Veluraja K. Studies on the effect of *Phyllanthus emblica* extract on the growth of urinary type struvite crystals invitro. Clinical Phytoscience. 2015; 1:3.
93. Joshi V. Effect of supernatant solutions on the formation of Liesegang rings. International Journal of Innovative Research in Science, Engineering and Technology. 2016; 5(1):1027-1031.
94. Ahmed S, Hasan M, Mahmood ZA. *In vitro* microscopic study of calcium oxalate monohydrate crystals growth patterns. Journal of Pharmaceutical and Scientific Innovation. 2016; 5(2):69-73. http://doi.10.7897/2277-4572.05215
95. Ahmed S, Hasan M, Mahmood ZA. *In vitro* microscopic study of calcium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate crystals growth patterns. World Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences. 2016; 4(1):64-67.
96. Selvaraju R, Sulochana S. *In-vitro* growth and inhibition studies of *Tribulus terrestris* on calcium oxalate monohydrate crystals. International Journal of Science and Research. 2016; 5(6):83-87.
97. Muryanto S, Sutanti S, Kasmiyatun M. Inhibition of struvite crystal growth in the presence of herbal extract *Orthosiphon aristatus* BL. MIQ. MATEC Web of Conferences. 2016; 58:01013. http://dx.doi.org/10.1051/matecconf/20165801013